Vibrationally Assisted Intersystem Crossing in Benchmark Thermally Activated Delayed Fluorescence Molecules

Emrys W. Evans,†‡* Yoann Olivier,‡* Yuttapoom Puttisong,‡*† William K. Myers,§ Timothy J. H. Hele,†† S. Matthew Menke,†* Tudor H. Thomas,† Dan Credgington,† David Beljonne,‡ Richard H. Friend,†* and Neil C. Greenham†*

† Cavendish Laboratory, University of Cambridge, J. J. Thomson Avenue, Cambridge CB3 0HE, United Kingdom
‡ Laboratory for Chemistry of Novel Materials, University of Mons, Place du Parc 20, B-7000 Mons, Belgium
§ Centre for Advanced Electron Spin Resonance (CAESR), University of Oxford, South Parks Road, Oxford OX1 3Q, United Kingdom

Supporting Information

ABSTRACT: Electrically injected charge carriers in organic light-emitting devices (OLEDs) undergo recombination events to form singlet and triplet states in a 1:3 ratio, representing a fundamental hurdle for achieving high quantum efficiency. Dopants based on thermally activated delayed fluorescence (TADF) have emerged as promising candidates for addressing the spin statistics issue in OLEDs. In these materials, reverse singlet–triplet intersystem crossing (rISC) becomes efficient, thereby activating luminescence pathways for weakly emissive triplet states. However, despite a growing consensus that torsional vibrations facilitate spin–orbit-coupling (SOC)-driven ISC in these molecules, there is a shortage of experimental evidence. We use transient electron spin resonance and theory to show unambiguously that SOC interactions drive spin conversion and that ISC is a dynamic process gated by conformational fluctuations for benchmark carbazolyl–dicyanobenzene TADF emitters.

The important role of spin in optoelectronics for organic systems has long been recognized, and in a nutshell, triplet states (T1) are best avoided. Triplet states provide unwanted loss pathways for charge generation in photovoltaics, and their generally nonemissive nature is at the heart of the classical 25% maximum quantum efficiency limit for OLEDs. Many strategies have been developed to deal with the triplet problem, with much attention since 2012 given to molecules exhibiting thermally activated delayed fluorescence (TADF). The name of this phenomenon has been widely adopted in optoelectronics and is equivalent to E-type delayed fluorescence.

Typically, dopants based on TADF have been designed to have a small singlet–triplet energy splitting (ΔE_{ST}). By this scheme, luminescence can be thermally activated from otherwise dark triplet states by efficient intersystem crossing to the emissive singlet excited state (S1). The simple design rule has led to the discovery of a multitude of molecules exhibiting TADF and a highly active field of research. In general, systems with small ΔE_{ST} are associated with S1 and T1 having high charge-transfer (CT) character in which the hole and electron densities are spatially separated, either within the same molecule (e.g., 4CzIPN, 2CzPN, TXO-TPA, and PIC-TRZ) or between molecules (e.g., m-MTDATA:3T-PYMB). However, despite much success by following this principle, open questions remain as to the mechanism for intersystem crossing and how TADF might be best realized.

Among many notable efforts to understand the general spin interconversion mechanism, Etherington et al. highlighted El-Sayed’s rule to explain that pure CT states cannot undergo spin conversion mediated by spin–orbit coupling (SOC) interactions. A “spin-vibronic” mechanism is suggested whereby the T1 state can be vibronically coupled to other triplet states of high local excited (LE) character. It is important that the higher-lying states have electronic wave functions which lead to significant (and thereby, nonzero) SOC matrix elements with S1. Overall, mixing of the higher-lying triplet states into the T1 wave function enables efficient interconversion with S1.

The spin-vibronic model is supported by computational studies combining molecular dynamics (MD) simulations and time-dependent density functional theory calculations within the Tamm–Dancoff approximation (TDA-DFT) which enables a fully atomistic representation of TADF emitters in the solid state as well as a characterization of their lowest singlet and triplet excited states. It was found that the S1 and T1 adiabatic states have a strongly mixed CT/LE character,

Received: May 17, 2018
Accepted: June 29, 2018
Published: June 29, 2018
with the extent of mixing depending on the instantaneous molecular conformation, i.e., the torsion angle between the electron-donating and -accepting units. The CT/LE character was quantified by computing the overlap index $\phi_S$ within the attachment/detachment formalism\textsuperscript{17} (for pure, “ionic” CT, $\phi_S \rightarrow 0$; for pure LE, $\phi_S \rightarrow 1$). It emerged that the time-dependent CT/LE character of excited states results in time-dependent SOC matrix elements and $\Delta E_{ST}$, leading to gated S$_1$-T$_1$ spin conversion.

It is worth emphasizing that coupling to vibrational modes plays a significant role in SOC-mediated ISC for a number of systems with large exchange energies, ranging from anthra-
and porphyrins to chlorophyll and nitrogen-vacancy diamond centers (in the guise of phonons). As the role of vibronic coupling in mediating intersystem crossing for TADF becomes more widely accepted, it is noteworthy that there is a shortage of direct, experimental evidence (see review by Penfold et al.23) to counter claims that nuclear-electron hyperfine interactions mediate ISC in such systems with low exchange energies.24 In one example, Etherington et al. suggested that the TADF luminescence intensity is maximized when S₁ and a 3LE (T₂) triplet are degenerate.25 Similarly, coupling of the 1CT (S₁) to the 1LE state was considered by Hosoki et al. to be the determining factor as to whether or not different carbazolyl-dicyanobenzene derivatives exhibiting near-identical ΔEST (≈ 0.2 eV ≫ kT) demonstrated appreciable TADF.25

Here we use transient electron spin resonance (TrESR) to explore the mechanism of spin mixing of S₁ and T₁ states in molecules exhibiting TADF. Our experimental results provide clear evidence for SOC-mediated intersystem crossing triggered by thermally populated soft (torsional) vibrational modes. Furthermore, the experiments can be rationalized by simple group theory considerations and conformational analysis.26

1,2,3,5-Tetrakis(carbazol-9-yl)-4,6-dicyanobenzene (4CzIPN) and 1,2-bis(carbazol-9-yl)-4,5-dicyanobenzene (2CzPN) were selected for this study as they belong to the aforementioned class of carbazolyl-dicyanobenzene derivatives first presented by Uoyama et al. in the seminal TADF paper. These molecules are often considered to be a “benchmark” for TADF OLEDs due to their short radiative lifetimes and high quantum efficiency in devices. 4CzIPN has been found to out-perform 2CzPN; this has been attributed to the LUMO=420 nm) and 4CzIPN (460 nm) was used (cf. Figure 1b). We consider that this condition realizes excited states which are most comparable to those formed at dopant centers following charge recombination. However, we also note that replicating the stated experimental conditions used by Ogiwara et al. (10 μM conc. in toluene and sample excitation at 355 nm) also gave rise to an EEEAAA signal for 4CzIPN. Again, our results are in contrast to the previous study (see Figure S1), and thereby warrant reinterpretation of the spin polarization implications for ISC in 4CzIPN.

TrESR density plots for the ESR signals with respect to magnetic field and time can be found in the Supporting Information (Figure S2), showing that the polarized triplet signals decay over several microseconds due to a combination of triplet lifetime and spin relaxation effects.

As mentioned above, the width of the triplet state ESR spectrum depends on interactions between electron spins. In more detail, for all-organic molecules, these are magnetic dipole–dipole interactions which lift the degeneracy of the triplet sublevels even in the absence of magnetic field (see Figure 2a,b). This effect is termed the zero-field splitting (ZFS) and is described by the following Hamiltonian:

\[ \hat{H}_{\text{ZFS}} = D \left( \hat{S}_z^2 - \frac{1}{3} \hat{S}_x^2 - \frac{1}{3} \hat{S}_y^2 \right) + E (\hat{S}_x^2 - \hat{S}_y^2) \]

where \( \hat{S} \) is the total spin angular momentum operator (\( \hat{S} = [\hat{S}_x, \hat{S}_y, \hat{S}_z] \)), with \( \hat{S}_i \) corresponding to the operator for the i-component of the spin angular momentum); \( D = \frac{1}{2} D_z \) and \( E = \frac{1}{2} (D_x - D_y) \), with \(|D_1| \leq |D_2| \leq |D_3| \) being the principal values for the ZFS interaction tensor.

The nodes observed in the TrESR spectra are highlighted in Figure 2c,d, and correspond to canonical orientations of the magnetic field with respect to the principal axes of the ZFS tensor. Consequently, it is possible to infer the magnitude of the ZFS interaction parameters directly from the ESR spectra as indicated in Figure 2c. For 2CzPN, \( |D_1| = 68 \text{ mT (7.9 } \mu \text{eV),} |E| = 15 \text{ mT (1.7 } \mu \text{eV)} \) for 4CzIPN \( |D_1| = 40 \text{ mT (4.6 } \mu \text{eV),} |E| = 11 \text{ mT (1.3 } \mu \text{eV)} \).

We have investigated the nature of T₁ states (i.e., associated spin distribution, ZFS tensor) with density functional theory (DFT) calculations using the PBE0 exchange-correlation functional and EPR-II basis set.26,28,29 The geometry-optimized T₁ states for 2CzPN (Figure 1d) and 4CzIPN (Figure 1e) are depicted with associated hole-“HOMO” and electron-“LUMO”. It is apparent that the triplet orbitals are spread across the entirety of the molecules, overlapping at the central benzene group (Figure 1d,e). Explicit calculations of
and the EPR-II basis set (0 K). We observe that the optimized geometries as obtained with the B3LYP functional, see Figure 3a,b, in agreement with the DFT triplet-state-actually observed for 2CzPN (300 K) molecular dynamics simulations. Plots of $D$ versus overlap index ($\phi$) for (c) 2CzPN and (d) 4CzIPN.

**Table 1. Spin–Orbit Coupling Matrix Elements for $a$, $b$, and $c$-Components As Defined in the Coordinate System Indicated in Figure 1a,c**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>0 K, SOC matrix elements (meV)</th>
<th>dynamic, 300 K, mean and standard deviation of SOC matrix elements (meV)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\mu(SOC_a)$ ± $\sigma(SOC_a)$</td>
<td>$\mu(SOC_b)$ ± $\sigma(SOC_b)$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2CzPN</td>
<td>1.2 × 10$^{-3}$ ± 2.7 × 10$^{-2}$</td>
<td>1.77 × 10$^{-2}$ ± 1.63 × 10$^{-2}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4CzIPN</td>
<td>1.7 × 10$^{-3}$ ± 1.9 × 10$^{-2}$</td>
<td>7.46 × 10$^{-3}$ ± 5.97 × 10$^{-3}$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The “static, 0 K” calculation was conducted for UKS-DFT, T1-derived geometries. The “dynamic, 300 K” results were obtained by taking the average and standard deviation for the 200 molecular geometries extracted from one snapshot of 300 K molecular dynamics simulations.

the ZFS parameter $D$ confirms that 2CzPN exhibits a more “rod”-like spin density distribution and thus the characteristic prolate splitting ($D < 0$, Figure 2a) of the triplet sublevels, while 4CzIPN displays a more “disc”-like spin density distribution and an oblate ZFS ($D > 0$, see Figure 2b). In 2CzPN, the long axis of the “rod” follows the assigned $a$-axis; while for 4CzIPN, which has a more discoid shape, the $b$-axis is perpendicular to the plane of the disc. Although DFT is a reliable method for prolate/oblate assignment in all-organic systems, the absolute calculated values are known to underestimate ZFS parameters routinely: here, 2CzPN, $|D| = 6.9 \mu$eV (calculation) < 7.9 \mu eV (experiment); 4CzIPN, $|D| = 2.2 \mu$eV (calculation) < 4.6 \mu eV (experiment).

By extending the ZFS calculation to a set of 200 molecular geometries extracted from one snapshot of room-temperature (300 K) molecular dynamics (MD) simulations, we found that prolate and oblate ZFS spin distributions are predominantly observed for 2CzPN ($\sim$90%) and 4CzIPN ($\sim$82%)—see Figure 3a,b, in agreement with the DFT triplet-state-optimized geometries as obtained with the B3LYP functional and the EPR-II basis set (0 K). We observe that the magnitude of $D$ has a positive correlation with increasing the overlap index $\phi$, i.e. the LE character (Figure 3c,d). This is intuitively understood by the interspin distance dependence of the ZFS parameter. Because ZFS arises from dipole–dipole interaction, the ZFS parameter $D$ is proportional to $(1−3\cos^2\theta)/r^3$, where $r$ is the interspin distance, and $\theta$ is the angle between the interspin vector and the maximum dipolar coupling axis. In a classical picture, the interspin distance is expected to decrease (increase) with increasing LE (CT) character as quantified by $\phi$, supporting the mixed CT-LE nature of the excited states in TADF materials. Analogous plots for $E$ are given in Figure S3 of the Supporting Information.

The population of the different $T_1$ sublevels immediately after excitation follows the magnitude of the ISC rate from $S_1$ to the $T_1$ sublevels. In a Fermi’s Golden Rule formalism, the difference in ISC rate is mainly driven by the difference in the expectation value of the spin–orbit coupling matrix elements: $SOC_{a,b,c} = \langle T_{1,i=a,b,c} | H_{SOC,S1} | S_1 \rangle$ from $S_1$ to $T_{1,i=a,b,c}$ since the Franck–Condon factors associated with $T_{1,i=a,b,c}$ and $S_1$ are negligibly different. The ZFS interaction is on the order of ~1–10 $\mu$eV, and thus energetics are expected to play a minor role in determining relative ISC rates for the sublevels.

Explicit calculation of the spin–orbit coupling matrix elements for the 0 K geometries found that $SOC_{a,b,c}$ are much smaller (at least 2 orders of magnitude) than $SOC_c$—see Table 1. This is understood readily from group theory and symmetry (see Supporting Information) when associating 2CzPN and
4CzIPN to the $C_2$ symmetry point group and considering $c$ as the polarization axis. Therefore, the populations of $T_{1,a}$ and $T_{1,b}$ are negligible while that of the $T_{1,c}$ sublevel is close to 1. However, when accounting for such population partition among the triplet sublevels, poor fits for simulated TrESR spectra as well as incorrect AAEEAE and EAEAEA polarization patterns are obtained for 2CzPN and 4CzIPN, respectively. Thus, a purely electronic model neglecting higher-order effects associated with vibronic interactions fails, even qualitatively, to reproduce the experimental TrESR data ("Fit – no vibronic in Figure 2c,d). See Supporting Information for full text details.

Previously, we have shown that consideration of vibronic coupling in the singlet and triplet manifolds of states was essential when computing ISC rates for TADF materials. More specifically, 2CzPN and 4CzIPN consist of “donor” (i.e., carbazole) and “acceptor” (i.e., cyano-) groups associated with a shared moiety (i.e., a benzene core), with an appreciable amount of torsional freedom available. It was demonstrated that conformational freedom leads to modulation of the instantaneous CT/LE mixing (quantified through overlap index), triggering significant SOC between the singlet and triplet states, and thereby allowing ISC. Thus, vibronic coupling was deemed necessary to reach the compromise between reduced $\Delta E_{ct}$ and appreciable SOC matrix elements for reverse ISC ($T_1 \rightarrow S_1$).

In order to assess the role of vibronic interactions on steering the relative populations of the triplet sublevels, we repeated the SOC calculations along the same 300 K classical MD trajectory used for obtaining the geometries examined in Figure 3. As indicated in Table 1, proper sampling of all vibrational degrees of freedom, notably of the torsion modes, largely homogenizes the $a$-, $b$-, and $c$-components of the SOC, and as a result the respective sublevel populations (though a slight $c$-bias persists). In an analogous manner, the large standard deviation values also indicate that the variation of SOC elements are associated with floppy carbazole torsional modes. Similar to Herzberg–Teller intensity borrowing effects in optical absorption, coupling of the electronic and vibrational degrees of freedom at various orders relaxes the symmetry constraints pertaining to purely electronic processes and is here accounted for in a nonperturbative way.

The experimental ESR data are in line with the SOC matrix elements presented in Table 1. Namely, for the prolate 2CzPN (Figure 2a) and oblate 4CzIPN (Figure 2b) triplet species, the analysis of the polarized ESR signals directly points to non-negligible spin conversion to the $a$- and $b$-levels as observed in experiment, thereby providing definitive and direct evidence for the role of vibronic coupling in spin interconversion. Critically, torsional freedom between the “donor” and “acceptor” moieties in the classical TADF motif enables additional ISC pathways between $S_1$ and $T_1$.

## ASSOCIATED CONTENT

![Supporting Information](#)

The Supporting Information is available free of charge on the ACS Publications website at DOI: 10.1021/acs.jpclett.8b01556

The data underlying this paper are available at https://doi.org/10.17863/CAM.23135.

Further experimental details for the TrESR experiments; ESR simulation and experiment details, and additional data; $E$-distribution from molecular dynamics; and symmetry and group theory considerations for evaluating spin–orbit coupling elements (PDF)

## AUTHOR INFORMATION

### Corresponding Author

*E-mail: ncg11@cam.ac.uk (N.C.G.).

### ORCID

Emrys W. Evans: 0000-0002-9092-3938

Yuttapoom Puttisong: 0000-0002-9690-6231

Timothy J. H. Hele: 0000-0003-2367-3825

S. Matthew Menke: 0000-0003-4468-0223

Richard H. Friend: 0000-0001-6565-6308

Neil C. Greenham: 0000-0002-2155-2432

### Author Contributions

$^*$Denotes an equal contribution.

### Notes

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

E.W.E., N.C.G. and R.H.F. would like to thank the EPSRC for funding (EP/M01083X/1, EP/M005143/1). Y.P. is grateful to The Swedish Research Council VR2015-00436 for a postdoc grant. W.K.M. is supported by the EPSRC grant EP/L011972/1 for CAESR (Centre for Advanced Electron Spin Resonance). T.J.H.H. thanks Jesus College, Cambridge, for a Research Fellowship. DJNC acknowledges the Royal Society for a University Research Fellowship. The work in Mons was supported by the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation program under Grant Agreement No. 646176 (EXTMOS project) and by Belgian National Fund for Scientific Research (FNRS/F.R.S.). Computational resources have been provided by the Consortium des Equipements de Calcul Intensif (CECI), funded by F.R.S.-FNRS under Grant No. 2.5020.11 as well as the Tier-1 supercomputer of the Fédération Wallonie-Bruxelles, funded by the Walloon Region under Grant Agreement No. 1117545. D.B. is a FNRS Research Director. Y.O. acknowledges stimulating discussions with Prof. J. C. Sancho-Garcia from the University of Alicante and Prof. L. Muccioli from the University of Bologna.

## REFERENCES


